

Date: Dec 27, 2020
To: "Zainul Kisman" zainulkisman@trilogi.ac.id
From: "Cogent Business and Management" business@cogentoa.com
Subject: 209657716 (Cogent Business & Management) A revise decision has been made on your submission

Ref: COGENTBUSINESS-2020-0306
209657716

The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange.
Cogent Business & Management

Dear Dr Zainul Kisman,

Your manuscript entitled "The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange.", which you submitted to Cogent Business & Management, has now been reviewed.

The reviews, included at the bottom of the letter, indicate that your manuscript could be suitable for publication following revision. We hope that you will consider these suggestions, and revise your manuscript.

Please submit your revision by Jan 26, 2021, if you need additional time then please contact the Editorial Office.

To submit your revised manuscript please go to <https://rp.cogentoa.com/dashboard/> and log in. You will see an option to Revise alongside your submission record.

If you are unsure how to submit your revision, please contact us on business@cogentoa.com

Please ensure that you include the following elements in your revised submission:

* public interest statement - a description of your paper of NO MORE THAN 150 words suitable for a non-specialist reader, highlighting/explaining anything which will be of interest to the general public (to find about more about how to write a good Public Interest Statement, and how it can benefit your research, you can take a look at this short article: <http://explore.cogentoa.com/author-tool-kit/public-interest-statement>)

* about the author - a short summary of NO MORE THAN 150 WORDS, detailing either your own or your group's key research activities, including a note on how the research reported in this paper relates to wider projects or issues.

You also have the option of including the following:

* photo of the author(s), including details of who is in the photograph - please note that we can only publish one photo

* cover image - you are able to create a cover page for your article by supplying an image for this purpose, or nominating a figure from your article. If you supply a new image, please obtain relevant permissions to reproduce the image if you do not own the copyright

If you require advice on language editing for your manuscript or assistance with arranging translation, please do consider using the Taylor & Francis Editing Services.

Please ensure that you clearly highlight changes made to your manuscript, as well as submitting a thorough response to reviewers.

We look forward to receiving your revised article.

Best wishes,
David McMillan
Senior Editor

Cogent Business & Management

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Conclusions – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

References – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Sound

Writing – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Not applicable

Comments to the author

Reviewer 1: After reviewing your manuscript, titled "The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange." following are my comments for improving it:

The abstract should be revised. Striking sentences emphasizing the work should be added. In addition, the numerical data obtained in the study should be mentioned.

Introduction section should be rewritten, the innovative aspect and expected results of the study should be mentioned.

The final paragraph of Literature Review is not adding any new information for readers. Considering the quality of the journal, the Literature Review should be more striking and rewritten.

Explain how this study can find application area? Scientific explanations should be made on this subject.

Further, i recommend highlighting the contribution to overall body of knowledge in the conclusion section.

In the text there are errors in English, need to be carefully read and corrected.

Moreover, there are errors in References section, should be carefully corrected according to the journal guidelines.

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Conclusions – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

References – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound

Writing – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Sound

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation
Reviewer 3: Not applicable

Comments to the author

Reviewer 3: 1. Literature survey should be revised including recent articles. The following articles may be included but not limited to:

An inventory model of three-layer supply chain of wood and furniture industry in the Caribbean region of Colombia, International Journal of Systems Science: Operations & Logistics 5 (1), 69-86, 2018.

A hybrid artificial neural network with metaheuristic algorithms for predicting stock price, Cybernetics and Systems 48 (4), 365-392, 2017.

2. Many variable and parameters are used here. So please mention broadly its physical significance.

3. Mathematical analyses are not well presented. Feasibility of this mathematical model is not described properly. Please do that accurately.

4. The managerial implications of this study, i.e. "what's the big deal?", are not well-explained. How would logistics operations managers be benefited from the findings of your study? What are the specific action plans based on the research findings? These should be addressed.

5. Please highlight the contribution of this study, with reference to practice and contribution to the literature and solution methodology/applications. It is critical to compare the findings with the prior literature as well as check whether the findings can challenge/support the current industrial practice

6. Please add managerial implication of this model broadly.

7. The conclusion section is too weak for the readers. Please elaborate this considering the achievements of this study and future directions and limitations, etc.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. ([Remove my information/details](#)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: Jan 19, 2021
To: "Zainul Kisman" zainulkisman@trilogi.ac.id
From: "Cogent Business and Management" business@cogentoa.com
Subject: Your revision is due soon

Ref: 209657716

The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange.
Cogent Business & Management

Dear Dr Zainul Kisman,

Cogent Business & Management is hoping to receive the revision of The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange. (209657716) by Jan 26, 2021. We hope that work is going well on your revision and that you will be able to submit on time; if you require more time, however, please contact the Editorial office.

Please ensure that you include the following elements in your revised submission:

- * public interest statement - a description of your paper of NO MORE THAN 150 words suitable for a non-specialist reader, highlighting/explaining anything that will be of interest to the general public (to find about more about how to write a good Public Interest Statement, and how it can benefit your research, you can take a look at this short article: <http://explore.cogentoa.com/author-tool-kit/public-interest-statement>)
- * about the author - a short summary of NO MORE THAN 150 WORDS, detailing either your own or your group's key research activities, including a note on how the research reported in this paper relates to wider projects or issues. You also have the option of including the following:
- * photo of the author(s), including details of who is in the photograph - please note that we can only publish one photo
- * cover image - you are able to create a cover page for your article by supplying an image for this purpose, or nominating a figure from your article. If you supply a new image, please obtain relevant permissions to reproduce the image if you do not own the copyright

If you require advice on language editing for your manuscript or assistance with arranging translation, please do consider using the Taylor & Francis Editing Services.

If you are ready to submit your revision, then please go to <https://rp.cogentoa.com/dashboard/> and login. You will see an option to Revise alongside your submission record.

We look forward to receiving your revised paper, but please do let us know if you need any assistance.

If you decide not to submit a revision, please contact us at business@cogentoa.com

Best wishes,

Cogent Business & Management - Editorial Office

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/COGENTBUSINESS/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: Jan 26, 2021
To: "Zainul Kisman" zainulkisman@trilogi.ac.id
From: "Cogent Business and Management" business@cogentoa.com
Subject: Your revision is due

Ref: 209657716

The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange.
Cogent Business & Management

Dear Dr Zainul Kisman,

This is a gentle reminder that the revision of The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange. (209657716) is expected today

We look forward to receiving your revised paper, and please do let us know if you need any assistance or if you need more time.

If you are ready to submit your revision, then please go to <https://rp.cogentoa.com/dashboard/> and login. You will see an option to Revise alongside your submission record.

If you decide not to submit a revision, please contact us at business@cogentoa.com

We look forward to receiving your revised submission.

Best wishes,

Cogent Business & Management - Editorial Office

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/COGENTBUSINESS/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: Feb 09, 2021
To: "Zainul Kisman" zainulkisman@trilogi.ac.id
From: "Cogent Business and Management" business@cogentoa.com
Subject: Your revision is past due

Ref: 209657716

The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange.
Cogent Business & Management

Dear Dr Zainul Kisman,

We hoped to receive the revision of COGENTBUSINESS-2020-0306 by Jan 26, 2021. May I ask if you are currently revising your paper ready for resubmission in Cogent Business & Management?

If you require more time or you have decided not to submit a revision, please contact us at business@cogentoa.com

If you are ready to submit your revision, then please go to <https://rp.cogentoa.com/dashboard/> and login. You will see an option to Revise alongside your submission record.

Please ensure that you include the following elements in your revised submission:

- * public interest statement - a description of your paper of NO MORE THAN 150 words suitable for a non-specialist reader, highlighting/explaining anything which will be of interest to the general public (to find about more about how to write a good Public Interest Statement, and how it can benefit your research, you can take a look at this short article: <http://explore.cogentoa.com/author-tool-kit/public-interest-statement>)
- * about the author - a short summary of NO MORE THAN 150 WORDS, detailing either your own or your group's key research activities, including a note on how the research reported in this paper relates to wider projects or issues. You also have the option of including the following:
 - * photo of the author(s), including details of who is in the photograph - please note that we can only publish one photo
 - * cover image - you are able to create a cover page for your article by supplying an image for this purpose, or nominating a figure from your article. If you supply a new image, please obtain relevant permissions to reproduce the image if you do not own the copyright

We look forward to receiving your revision soon.

Kind regards,

Cogent Business & Management - Editorial Office

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/COGENTBUSINESS/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Date: Dec 27, 2020
To: "Zainul Kisman" zainulkisman@trilogi.ac.id
From: "Cogent Business and Management" business@cogentoa.com
Subject: 209657716 (Cogent Business & Management) A revise decision has been made on your submission

Ref: COGENTBUSINESS-2020-0306
209657716

The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange.
Cogent Business & Management

Dear Dr Zainul Kisman,

Your manuscript entitled "The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange.", which you submitted to Cogent Business & Management, has now been reviewed.

The reviews, included at the bottom of the letter, indicate that your manuscript could be suitable for publication following revision. We hope that you will consider these suggestions, and revise your manuscript.

Please submit your revision by Jan 26, 2021, if you need additional time then please contact the Editorial Office.

To submit your revised manuscript please go to <https://rp.cogentoa.com/dashboard/> and log in. You will see an option to Revise alongside your submission record.

If you are unsure how to submit your revision, please contact us on business@cogentoa.com

Please ensure that you include the following elements in your revised submission:

* public interest statement - a description of your paper of NO MORE THAN 150 words suitable for a non-specialist reader, highlighting/explaining anything which will be of interest to the general public (to find about more about how to write a good Public Interest Statement, and how it can benefit your research, you can take a look at this short article: <http://explore.cogentoa.com/author-tool-kit/public-interest-statement>)

* about the author - a short summary of NO MORE THAN 150 WORDS, detailing either your own or your group's key research activities, including a note on how the research reported in this paper relates to wider projects or issues.

You also have the option of including the following:

* photo of the author(s), including details of who is in the photograph - please note that we can only publish one photo

* cover image - you are able to create a cover page for your article by supplying an image for this purpose, or nominating a figure from your article. If you supply a new image, please obtain relevant permissions to reproduce the image if you do not own the copyright

If you require advice on language editing for your manuscript or assistance with arranging translation, please do consider using the Taylor & Francis Editing Services.

Please ensure that you clearly highlight changes made to your manuscript, as well as submitting a thorough response to reviewers.

We look forward to receiving your revised article.

Best wishes,
David McMillan
Senior Editor

Cogent Business & Management

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Sound

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Sound

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Sound

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Sound

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Sound

Conclusions – overall evaluation
Reviewer 1: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

References – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Writing – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Not applicable

Comments to the author

Reviewer 1: After reviewing your manuscript, titled "The Solution to Overcome the Disappearing Dividend Phenomenon: Learn from the Experience of the Indonesia Stock Exchange." following are my comments for improving it:

The abstract should be revised. Striking sentences emphasizing the work should be added. In addition, the numerical data obtained in the study should be mentioned.

Introduction section should be rewritten, the innovative aspect and expected results of the study should be mentioned.

The final paragraph of Literature Review is not adding any new information for readers. Considering the quality of the journal, the Literature Review should be more striking and rewritten.

Explain how this study can find application area? Scientific explanations should be made on this subject.

Further, i recommend highlighting the contribution to overall body of knowledge in the conclusion section.

In the text there are errors in English, need to be carefully read and corrected.

Moreover, there are errors in References section, should be carefully corrected according to the journal guidelines.

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Conclusions – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

References – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound

Writing – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Sound

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation

Reviewer 3: Not applicable

Comments to the author

Reviewer 3: 1. Literature survey should be revised including recent articles. The following articles may be included but not limited to:

An inventory model of three-layer supply chain of wood and furniture industry in the Caribbean region of Colombia, International Journal of Systems Science: Operations & Logistics 5 (1), 69-86, 2018.

A hybrid artificial neural network with metaheuristic algorithms for predicting stock price, Cybernetics and Systems 48 (4), 365-392, 2017.

2. Many variable and parameters are used here. So please mention broadly its physical significance.

3. Mathematical analyses are not well presented. Feasibility of this mathematical model is not described properly. Please do that accurately.

4. The managerial implications of this study, i.e. "what's the big deal?", are not well-explained. How would logistics operations managers be benefited from the findings of your study? What are the specific action plans based on the research findings? These should be addressed.

5. Please highlight the contribution of this study, with reference to practice and contribution to the literature and solution methodology/applications. It is critical to compare the findings with the prior literature as well as check whether the findings can challenge/support the current industrial practice

6. Please add managerial implication of this model broadly.

7. The conclusion section is too weak for the readers. Please elaborate this considering the achievements of this study and future directions and limitations, etc.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. ([Remove my information/details](#)). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.